Advocating for L1 Instruction

2015 Oregon Association for Bilingual Education

Edward Tabet-Cubero
Associate Director
Dual Language Education of New Mexico
www.dlenm.org
Dual Language Education of New Mexico

- Non-profit, grassroots organization (La Cosecha)
- DLeNM Strategic Plan:
  - Transformative leadership and advocacy
  - Clearinghouse for dual language resources [www.dlenm.org](http://www.dlenm.org)
  - Development of K-12 dual language model programs
Deficit vs Asset Mentalities

We are the ambassadors (key communicators) of our programs
Distinguishing between program model goals....and outcomes

Program Models:

- English Only (w/ESL-ELD)
- Bilingual Programs
- Dual Language Programs
Academic Programs for English Learners

Subtractive

- Structured English Immersion
- English Only Content with ESL
- Transitional Bilingual (early-exit)

Additive

- Maintenance Bilingual (Late Exit)
- Foreign Language Immersion
- One-Way Dual Language
- Two-Way Dual Language
Common Talking Points

- Legal Perspective
- Heritage Language as a Civil Right
- Benefits of bilingualism (competitiveness, brain research, etc.)
- The Data and Outcomes
- Cross-Language Transfer
Legal Background
Brief Legal History

14th Amendment

• Equal Protection Under the Law

Civil Rights Act of 1964

• Title VI: Bans discrimination on the basis of race, color, or national origin in federally assisted programs.

Equal Educational Opportunities Act of 1974

• All public school districts are required to “take appropriate action to overcome language barriers that impede equal participation by its students in its instructional programs.”
**Key Court Cases**

**Lau V. Nichols** (1974)

- "There is no equality of treatment merely by providing students with the same facilities, textbooks, teachers, and curriculum; for students who do not understand English are effectively foreclosed from any meaningful education... Imposition of a requirement that, before a child can effectively participate in the education program, he must already have acquired those basic skills is to make a mockery of public education."

**Castaneda v Pickard** (1981)

- OCR Guidelines, established that ELL programs must be:
  1. Based on sound educational theory recognized by experts in the field.
  2. Implemented effectively, with adequate resources and personnel.
  3. Evaluated and found effective in both the teaching of language (English and the students’ first language if the program is bilingual) and in access to the full curriculum.

**Plyler v Doe** (1982)

- Public schools are prohibited from:
  1. Denying undocumented students admission to school.
  2. Requiring students or parents to disclose or document their immigration status.
  3. Requiring social security numbers of students
What do the Federal ELL Requirements Boil Down To?

**English Language Development**

**Equal Access to Grade Level Academic Content**
Heritage Language as a Civil Right
"I said to my children, I’m going to work and do everything that I can do to see that you get a good education. I don’t ever want you to forget that there are millions of God’s children who will not and cannot get a good education, and I don’t want you feeling that you are better than they are. For you will never be what you ought to be until they are what they ought to be."

~MLK Jr.

In Darling-Hammond, 2009
For Native American communities, fostering indigenous languages is about much more than academic achievement or global competitiveness...it’s about maintaining a way of life, customs, and religion.
Benefits of Bilingualism
2/3 of children in the world grow up speaking more than one language

Top three languages utilized in the world: Spanish, English, Mandarin

Multi-tasking and Increased Cognitive Flexibility

Delays on-set of Alzheimer’s
Global Awareness:

1. Using 21st century skills to understand and address global issues

2. Learning from and working collaboratively with individuals representing diverse cultures, religions, and lifestyles in a spirit of mutual respect and open dialogue in personal, work, and community contexts

3. Promoting the study of languages other than English as a tool for understanding other nations and cultures
The US Language Gap:

“Twenty out of the 25 leading industrialized countries start teaching second languages from K to 5th grade and 21 of 31 countries in the European Union require nine years of second language learning.” ~Representative Judy Chu, CA, 2011

Patriotism = Monolingualism?
“Understand that my starting principle is everybody should be bilingual or everybody should be trilingual.”...We as a society do a really bad job teaching foreign languages, and it is costing us when it comes to being competitive in a global marketplace.”
Data and Outcomes
You can essentially predict the long-term achievement of an ELL based on their program in Kinder.

“Dual language programs are the only programs that assist students to fully reach the 50th percentile in both their first and second languages in all subjects and to maintain that level or higher through the end of schooling.”

~Thomas & Collier, 2002
English Learners’ Long-Term Achievement by Program Model

1– Two-Way Dual Language Ed. including Content ESL

2– One-Way Dual Language Ed. including Content ESL

3– Transitional Bilingual Ed., including ESL taught through academic content

4– Transitional Bilingual Ed., including ESL, taught traditionally

5– ESL taught through academic content (no L1)

6– ESL Pullout – (no L1) taught traditionally

7– Prop 227 in California
   Spring 1998 – Spring 2000
   (grades 2-9 in two-year cohorts)
What does the research say?

- Providing more hours of English does NOT result in higher English achievement

- Little Spanish and mostly English can lead to lower Spanish AND English achievement

- Providing dual language program instruction leads to higher English AND Spanish achievement

- Social class is still a factor – students on free lunch scored lower than students not on free lunch

And Connection to the Benefits of Bilingualism

- Multilingual students prepared for 21st century
- Global competitiveness
- Economics and National Security
- Strong Identity and Cultural Heritage
Cross-Language Transfer
Linguistic Interdependence Model
(Adapted from Cummins, J. 1987)

Common Underlying Proficiency

Surface features of L1

Knowledge/concepts unique to L1

Surface features of L2

Knowledge/concepts unique to L2
La petite fourmi préfère être seul.

*Prefers*
The bottom line... Academic Skills Transfer

- You only learn to read once. You don’t start over again when you move into a new language.

- Spanish and English reading instruction can compliment one another rather than compete for time.

- You only learn to do math once.

- You don’t relearn the concepts in a second language. You simply learn the L2 vocabulary and discourse patterns.
Select an Audience and Develop an Elevator Speech

Why do you teach students in their native language?

- Friends and Family
- Administration and Board of Education
- Business Leaders
- Other Teachers
- Students
“The ideological and programmatic disparities between English immersion and bilingual program models have prompted intense debate regarding the most effective method of instruction for ELL students. Proponents of immersion programs believe that providing instruction primarily in English and to a class with both ELL and native English speaking students forces ELL students to learn English more quickly (Adams and Jones, 2006). However, this claim represents a persistent misconception and does not align with optimal learning conditions that promote the development of academic or linguistic proficiency.”

In AIR, 2010
“Moreover, the research indicates that instructional programs work when they provide opportunities for students to develop proficiency in their first language. Studies that compare bilingual instruction with English-only instruction demonstrate that language-minority students instructed in their native language as well as in English perform better, on average, on measures of English reading proficiency than language-minority students instructed only in English. This is the case at both the elementary and secondary levels.”

August & Shanahan, 2006
“A substantial body of research suggests that literacy and other skills and knowledge transfer across languages. That is, if you learn something in one language, you either already know it in (i.e., transfer it to) another language or can more easily learn it in another language.”

- Goldenberg, 2008
“No other area in educational research with which I am familiar can claim five independent meta-analyses based on experimental studies—much less five that converge on the same basic finding.

To some people this finding might seem counterintuitive. A few years ago a fair-minded colleague expressed disbelief: “Doesn’t it just make sense,” she asked, “that the earlier and more intensively children are placed in all-English instruction at school the better their English achievement will eventually be?” That’s when it hit me: when the goal is English proficiency, delivering any instruction in the first language probably does not make sense to some people. But this is why we do scientific research: common sense does not always turn out to be the truth. If we only relied on common sense, we would still think the sun revolves around a flat earth.”

Goldenberg, 2008
“Findings from multiple research studies have established that rapid, unsupported English language acquisition is not a realistic goal for ELL instruction. Rather, students who have received little to no academic or cognitive development in their first language tend to do increasingly poorly as academic and cognitive demands increase after fourth grade and into the upper grades (Thomas and Collier, 2002).”
“There is also research to support the idea that learning a second language at a young age can be beneficial to both language and brain development. Research has shown that young children who learn two languages show more neural activity in the parts of the brain associated with language processing (Mechelli, 2004). “

in AIR, 2010
Dual Language Education of New Mexico

Edward Tabet-Cubero, Associate Director, edward@dlenm.org

Join us on Facebook